

FILED  
10-20-2023  
CLERK OF WISCONSIN  
SUPREME COURT

No. 2023AP001399-OA

---

IN THE SUPREME COURT OF WISCONSIN

---

REBECCA CLARKE, RUBEN ANTHONY, TERRY DAWSON, DANA GLASSTEIN, ANN GROVES-LLOYD, CARL HUJET, JERRY IVERSON, TIA JOHNSON, ANGIE KIRST, SELIKA LAWTON, FABIAN MALDONADO, ANNEMARIE MCCLELLAN, JAMES MCNETT, BRITTANY MURIELLO, ELA JOOSTEN (PARI) SCHILS, NATHANIEL SLACK, MARY SMITH-JOHNSON, DENISE (DEE) SWEET, AND GABRIELLE YOUNG,

*Petitioners,*

GOVERNOR TONY EVERS, IN HIS OFFICIAL CAPACITY; NATHAN ATKINSON, STEPHEN JOSEPH WRIGHT, GARY KRENZ, SARAH J. HAMILTON, JEAN-LUC THIFFEAULT, SOMESH JHA, JOANNE KANE, AND LEAH DUDLEY,

*Intervenors-Petitioners,*

*v.*

WISCONSIN ELECTIONS COMMISSION; DON MILLIS, ROBERT F. SPINDELL, JR., MARK L. THOMSEN, ANN S. JACOBS, MARGE BOSTELMANN, AND JOSEPH J. CZARNEZKI, IN THEIR OFFICIAL CAPACITIES AS MEMBERS OF THE WISCONSIN ELECTIONS COMMISSION; MEAGAN WOLFE, IN HER OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS THE ADMINISTRATOR OF THE WISCONSIN ELECTIONS COMMISSION; SENATOR ANDRÉ JACQUE, SENATOR TIM CARPENTER, SENATOR ROB HUTTON, SENATOR CHRIS LARSON, SENATOR DEVIN LEMAHIEU, SENATOR STEPHEN L. NASS, SENATOR JOHN JAGLER, SENATOR MARK SPREITZER, SENATOR HOWARD L. MARKLEIN, SENATOR RACHAEL CABRAL-GUEVARA, SENATOR VAN H. WANGGAARD, SENATOR JESSE L. JAMES, SENATOR ROMAINE ROBERT QUINN, SENATOR DIANNE H. HESSELBEIN, SENATOR CORY TOMCZYK, SENATOR JEFF SMITH, AND SENATOR CHRIS KAPENGA, IN THEIR OFFICIAL CAPACITIES AS MEMBERS OF THE WISCONSIN SENATE,

*Respondents,*

WISCONSIN LEGISLATURE; BILLIE JOHNSON, CHRIS GOEBEL, ED PERKINS, ERIC O'KEEFE, JOE SANFELIPPO, TERRY MOULTON, ROBERT JENSEN, RON ZAHN, RUTH ELMER, AND RUTH STRECK,

*Intervenors-Respondents.*

---

**MOTION TO DISMISS BY INTERVENOR-RESPONDENT WISCONSIN LEGISLATURE AND RESPONDENTS SENATORS CABRAL-GUEVARA, HUTTON, JACQUE, JAGLER, JAMES, KAPENGA, LEMAHIEU, MARKLEIN, NASS, QUINN, TOMCZYK, AND WANGGAARD**

---

*Counsel Listed on Following Page*

---

**BELL GIFTOS ST. JOHN LLC**

KEVIN M. ST. JOHN, SBN 1054815  
5325 Wall Street, Suite 2200  
Madison, WI 53718  
608.216.7995  
kstjohn@bellgiftos.com

**CONSOVOY MCCARTHY PLLC**

TAYLOR A.R. MEEHAN\*  
RACHAEL C. TUCKER\*  
DANIEL M. VITAGLIANO\*  
C'ZAR D. BERNSTEIN\*\*  
1600 Wilson Blvd., Suite 700  
Arlington, VA 22209  
703.243.9423  
taylor@consovoymccarthy.com

**LAWFAIR LLC**

ADAM K. MORTARA, SBN 1038391  
40 Burton Hills Blvd., Suite 200  
Nashville, TN 37215  
773.750.7154  
mortara@lawfairllc.com

**AUGUSTYN LAW LLC**

JESSIE AUGUSTYN, SBN 1098680  
1835 E. Edgewood Dr., Suite 105-478  
Appleton, WI 54913  
715.255.0817  
jessie@augustynlaw.com

**LEHOTSKY KELLER COHN LLP**

SCOTT A. KELLER\*  
SHANNON GRAMMEL\*  
GABRIELA GONZALEZ-ARAIZA\*  
200 Massachusetts Avenue, NW  
Suite 700  
Washington, DC 20001  
512.693.8350  
scott@lkcfirm.com

**LEHOTSKY KELLER COHN LLP**

MATTHEW H. FREDERICK\*  
408 West 11<sup>th</sup> St., Fifth Floor  
Austin, TX 78701  
matt@lkcfirm.com

\* *Admitted pro hac vice*

\*\* *Pro hac vice motion forthcoming*

Intervenor-Respondent the Wisconsin Legislature, through its counsel, and Respondents Senator Rachael Cabral-Guevara, Senator Rob Hutton, Senator Andre Jacque, Senator John Jagler, Senator Jesse L. James, Senator Chris Kapenga, Senator Devin LeMahieu, Senator Howard L. Marklein, Senator Stephen L. Nass, Senator Romaine Robert Quinn, Senator Cory Tomczyk, and Senator Van H. Wanggaard (the Respondent Senators), through their counsel, respectfully move to dismiss this case pursuant to Wis. Stat. §§802.06, 809.14, 809.63 and 809.84. For the reasons stated in the accompanying memorandum filed in support of this motion, this case should be dismissed.

1. This action challenges the constitutionality of Wisconsin's existing state legislative district boundaries and asks the Court to declare the existing boundaries unconstitutional, draw new boundaries, and order special elections. Pet. at 43-44.

2. The existing state legislative district boundaries were adopted by this Court in 2022, after being proposed by the Legislature and Petitioners in *Johnson v. Wisconsin Elections Commission (Johnson III)*, 2022 WI 19, 401 Wis. 2d 198, 972 N.W.2d 559. In the course of that

litigation, this Court decided or foreclosed every claim presented here. See *Johnson v. Wis. Elections Comm'n*, 2021 WI 87, ¶36, 399 Wis. 2d 623, 967 N.W.2d 469 (deciding contiguity); *id.* ¶3 (describing Court's role as "a purely judicial one"); *Johnson v. Wis. Elections Comm'n*, 2022 WI 14, ¶36, 400 Wis. 2d 626, 971 N.W.2d 402 (deciding contiguity); *Johnson III*, 2022 WI 19, ¶70 (same).

3. More than a year after *Johnson* became final, and one day after a change in this Court's membership, Petitioners filed this original action collaterally attacking *Johnson*. On October 6, 2023, this Court granted the petition in part. Some of the parties from *Johnson* intervened, including the Governor. The Court did not order the parties to submit responsive pleadings.

4. Dismissal is warranted for three independent reasons.

5. *First*, Petitioners lack standing to pursue either of their claims. Petitioners have not established any personal stake in this controversy and allege only generalized grievances.

6. *Second*, Petitioners and Intervenor-Petitioners' claims are barred by laches, preclusion, and estoppel.

7. *Third*, there is no legal basis for Petitioners' requested declaratory or injunctive relief, nor any legal basis for their request for a writ quo warranto. And for the reasons already briefed in the Legislature and Respondents Senators' opening brief, *stare decisis* precludes relitigation of their contiguity claim, and their separation-of-powers claim is based on a mistaken understanding of this Court's judgment in *Johnson*.

WHEREFORE, the Wisconsin Legislature and the Respondent Senators request that this case be dismissed.

Dated this 20th day of October, 2023.

Electronically Signed by

Jessie Augustyn

**AUGUSTYN LAW LLC**  
 JESSIE AUGUSTYN, SBN 1098680  
 1835 E. Edgewood Dr.,  
 Suite 105-478  
 Appleton, WI 54913  
 715.255.0817  
 jessie@augustynlaw.com

*Counsel for Respondents Senators  
 Cabral-Guevara, Hutton, Jacque,  
 Jagler, James, Kapenga, LeMahieu,  
 Marklein, Nass, Quinn, Tomczyk,  
 and Wanggaard*

**LEHOTSKY KELLER COHN LLP**  
 SCOTT A. KELLER\*  
 SHANNON GRAMMEL\*  
 GABRIELA GONZALEZ-ARAIZA\*  
 200 Massachusetts Avenue, NW  
 Suite 700  
 Washington, DC 20001  
 512.693.8350  
 scott@lkcfirm.com

**LEHOTSKY KELLER COHN LLP**  
 MATTHEW H. FREDERICK\*  
 408 West 11th St., Fifth Floor  
 Austin, TX 78701

*Counsel for Wisconsin Legislature &  
 Respondents Senators Cabral-Gue-  
 vara, Hutton, Jacque, Jagler, James,  
 Kapenga, LeMahieu, Marklein, Nass,  
 Quinn, Tomczyk, and Wanggaard*

Respectfully submitted.

Electronically Signed by

Kevin M. St. John

**BELL GIFTOS ST. JOHN LLC**  
 KEVIN M. ST. JOHN, SBN 1054815  
 5325 Wall Street, Suite 2200  
 Madison, WI 53718  
 608.216.7995  
 kstjohn@bellgiftos.com

**CONSOVOY MCCARTHY PLLC**  
 TAYLOR A.R. MEEHAN\*  
 RACHAEL C. TUCKER\*  
 DANIEL M. VITAGLIANO\*  
 C'ZAR BERNSTEIN\*\*  
 1600 Wilson Blvd., Suite 700  
 Arlington, VA 22209  
 703.243.9423  
 taylor@consovoymccarthy.com

**LAWFAIR LLC**  
 ADAM K. MORTARA, SBN 1038391  
 40 Burton Hills Blvd., Suite 200  
 Nashville, TN 37215  
 773.750.7154  
 mortara@lawfairllc.com

*Counsel for Wisconsin Legislature*

*\* Admitted pro hac vice*

*\*\* Pro hac vice motion forthcoming*