

**FILED**  
**05-06-2024**  
**CLERK OF WISCONSIN**  
**SUPREME COURT**

# EXHIBIT A

No. 2021AP1450-OA

IN THE SUPREME COURT OF WISCONSIN

BILLIE JOHNSON, ERIC O'KEEFE, ED PERKINS, AND RONALD ZAHN,

*Petitioners,*

BLACK LEADERS ORGANIZING FOR COMMUNITIES, VOCES DE LA FRONTERA, LEAGUE OF WOMEN VOTERS OF WISCONSIN, CINDY FALLONA, LAUREN STEPHENSON, REBECCA ALWIN, CONGRESSMAN GLENN GROTHMAN, CONGRESSMAN MIKE GALLAGHER, CONGRESSMAN BRYAN STEIL, CONGRESSMAN TOM TIFFANY, CONGRESSMAN SCOTT FITZGERALD, LISA HUNTER, JACOB ZABEL, JENNIFER OH, JOHN PERSA, GERALDINE SCHERTZ, KATHLEEN QUALHEIM, GARY KRENZ, SARAH J. HAMILTON, STEPHEN JOSEPH WRIGHT, JEAN-LUC THIFFEAULT, AND SOMESH JHA,

*Intervenors-Petitioners,*

v.

WISCONSIN ELECTIONS COMMISSION, MARGE BOSTELMANN, in her official capacity as a member of the Wisconsin Elections Commission, JULIE GLANCEY, in her official capacity as a member of the Wisconsin Elections Commission, ANN JACOBS, in her official capacity as a member of the Wisconsin Elections Commission, DEAN KNUDSON, in his official capacity as a member of the Wisconsin Elections Commission, ROBERT SPINDELL, JR., in his official capacity as a member of the Wisconsin Elections Commission, AND MARK THOMSEN, in his official capacity as a member of the Wisconsin Elections Commission,

*Respondents,*

THE WISCONSIN LEGISLATURE, GOVERNOR TONY EVERS, in his official capacity, AND JANET BEWLEY SENATE DEMOCRATIC MINORITY LEADER, on behalf of the Senate Democratic Caucus,

*Intervenors-Respondents.*

**MOTION TO RECUSE JUSTICE PROTASIEWICZ BY INTERVENOR-RESPONDENT WISCONSIN LEGISLATURE, PETITIONERS BILLIE JOHNSON, ERIC O'KEEFE, ED PERKINS, AND RONALD ZAHN, AND INTERVENORS-PETITIONERS CONGRESSMEN GLENN GROTHMAN, MIKE GALLAGHER, BRYAN STEIL, TOM TIFFANY, AND SCOTT FITZGERALD**

*Counsel Listed on Following Page*

**BELL GIFTOS ST. JOHN LLC**  
KEVIN M. ST. JOHN, SBN 1054815  
5325 Wall Street, Suite 2200  
Madison, WI 53718  
608.216.7995  
kstjohn@bellgiftos.com

**CONSOVOY MCCARTHY PLLC**  
TAYLOR A.R. MEEHAN\*  
1600 Wilson Blvd., Suite 700  
Arlington, VA 22209  
703.243.9423  
taylor@consovoymccarthy.com

**LAWFAIR LLC**  
ADAM K. MORTARA, SBN 1038391  
40 Burton Hills Blvd., Suite 200  
Nashville, TN 37215  
773.750.7154  
mortara@lawfairllc.com

\* *Admitted pro hac vice*

**WISCONSIN INSTITUTE  
FOR LAW & LIBERTY, INC.**  
RICHARD M. ESENBERG, SBN 1005622  
LUCAS T. VEBBER, SBN 1067543  
330 East Kilbourn Avenue, Suite 725  
Milwaukee, WI 53202  
414.727.9455  
Lucas@will-law.org

**TROUTMAN PEPPER HAMILTON  
SANDERS LLP**  
MISHA TSEYTLIN, SBN 1102199  
KEVIN M. LEROY, SBN 1105053  
227 W. Monroe, Suite 3900  
Chicago, IL 60606  
608.999.1240  
misha.tseytlin@troutman.com

Intervenor-Respondent the Wisconsin Legislature; Petitioners Billie Johnson, Eric O'Keefe, Ed Perkins, and Ronald Zahn; and Intervenor-Petitioners Congressmen Glenn Grothman, Mike Gallagher, Bryan Steil, Tom Tiffany, and Scott Fitzgerald hereby move to recuse Justice Janet Protasiewicz. For the reasons stated in the accompanying memorandum of law, the Due Process Clause of the Fourteenth Amendment to the United States Constitution and Wis. Stat. §§757.19(2)(f)-(g) require recusal.

1. Hunter Intervenor have asked this Court to reopen this case and redraw congressional district lines. They ask the Court to "resume the congressional remedial process" and draw districts less "favorable to the Republican Party," Memo. ISO Mot. Relief J. 21-22, 33, "in time for the 2024 congressional elections," Mot. Relief J. 3.

2. The existing congressional district boundaries were adopted by this Court as part of a mandatory injunction entered in 2022. See *Johnson v. Wis. Elections Comm'n (Johnson II)*, 2022 WI 14, 400 Wis. 2d 626, 971 N.W.2d 402. The Governor proposed that remedy,

and Hunter Intervenors said it complied with state and federal law and asked the Court to adopt it. *See* Hunter Br. 13 (Dec. 30, 2021).

3. During her campaign for a seat on the Wisconsin Supreme Court, Justice Protasiewicz publicly declared Wisconsin's districts "rigged" in favor of Republicans.<sup>1</sup> She criticized the Court's "least change" approach as "totally unfair."<sup>2</sup> As to the congressional maps, she stated, "You look at Congress—you know, we have eight seats—six are red, two are blue, in a battleground state. So, we know something's wrong."<sup>3</sup> Justice Protasiewicz "welcome[d] the opportunity to have a fresh look at our maps."<sup>4</sup> She said that she agreed with the dissenters in this case.<sup>5</sup> And she promised supporters and

---

<sup>1</sup> Zac Schultz, *Candidates tangle over political issues, judicial perspectives at first 2023 Wisconsin Supreme Court forum*, PBS Wis. (Jan. 10, 2023), <https://perma.cc/HC4L-NFUS> (App.10); WisPolitics State Supreme Court Election Forum Tr. 45:25-46:7 (Jan. 9, 2023) (App.24-25); *see* Corrinne Hess, *Wisconsin Supreme Court candidate Janet Protasiewicz assails state's election maps as 'rigged,' Milwaukee J. Sentinel* (Jan. 9, 2023), <https://perma.cc/8T33-Z5M6> (App.33).

<sup>2</sup> Channel 3000 / News 3 Now, *Wisconsin Supreme Court debate presented by News 3 Now and WisPolitics*, at 29:20-30:10, YouTube, <https://bit.ly/3HAtZtv> [hereinafter *Supreme Court Debate*].

<sup>3</sup> *Id.*

<sup>4</sup> Shawn Johnson, *In a supreme court race like no other, Wisconsin's political future is up for grabs*, NPR (Apr. 2, 2023), <https://perma.cc/W2YA-WPA2> (App.46).

<sup>5</sup> Henry Redman, *Supreme Court candidates accuse each other of lying, extremism in sole debate*, Wis. Exam'r (Mar. 21, 2023), <https://perma.cc/5KLA-S2FV> (App.51).

donors that electoral districts could be redrawn to change “the outcome of the 2024 election.”<sup>6</sup>

4. Moreover, the Democratic Party of Wisconsin contributed nearly \$10 million to Janet Protasiewicz’s campaign—more than all other donors to her campaign combined, and more than three times the size of the campaign contribution that triggered the due process violation in *Caperton v. A.T. Massey Coal. Co.*, 556 U.S. 868 (2009).

5. The Due Process Clause of the Fourteenth Amendment to the United States Constitution requires recusal. A justice cannot decide a case she has prejudged or when her participation otherwise creates a serious risk of actual bias. Justice Protasiewicz’s public campaign statements establish a constitutionally intolerable risk that she has prejudged the merits of this case. She has already said, “If you look at the dissent in that maps case”—*this case*—“that dissent is what I will tell you I agree with.”<sup>7</sup> And she has already said that “something’s wrong” with the existing 6-2 Republican congressional

---

<sup>6</sup> @janetforjustice, Twitter (Mar. 27, 2023, 12:47 PM), <https://perma.cc/YAL9-JR8R> (App.53); Janet for Justice, Facebook (Apr. 3, 2023), <https://perma.cc/HVD7-PXD5> (App.54).

<sup>7</sup> Redman, *supra* n.5, <https://perma.cc/5KLA-S2FV> (App.51).

delegation.<sup>8</sup> In addition, the risk of actual bias exists here because the Democratic Party of Wisconsin—the primary and intended beneficiary of Hunter Intervenors’ motion to reopen this case to obtain redrawn congressional district lines more favorable to Democrats—was the main contributor to Justice Protasiewicz’s campaign for a seat on this Court, providing almost \$10 million of the \$16.7 million spent by her campaign.

6. Wisconsin law also requires Justice Protasiewicz to recuse from these proceedings because “she cannot, or it appears . . . she cannot, act in an impartial manner” and because “she has a significant . . . personal interest in the outcome of the matter.” Wis. Stat. §757.19(2)(f)-(g).

WHEREFORE, movants request that Justice Protasiewicz recuse from all aspects of these proceedings, including Hunter Intervenors’ pending motion for relief from judgment.

---

<sup>8</sup> *Supreme Court Debate, supra* n.2, <https://bit.ly/3HAiZtv>.

Dated this 29th day of January, 2024.

Respectfully submitted,

Electronically Signed by

Kevin M. St. John

**BELL GIFTOS ST. JOHN LLC**

KEVIN M. ST. JOHN, SBN 1054815

5325 Wall Street, Ste. 2200

Madison, WI 53718

608.216.7995

kstjohn@bellgiftos.com

**CONSOVOY MCCARTHY PLLC**

TAYLOR A.R. MEEHAN\*

1600 Wilson Blvd., Ste. 700

Arlington, VA 22209

703.243.9423

taylor@consovoymccarthy.com

**LAWFAIR LLC**

ADAM K. MORTARA, SBN 1038391

40 Burton Hills Blvd., Ste. 200

Nashville, TN 37215

773.750.7154

mortara@lawfairllc.com

*Counsel for Wisconsin Legislature*

\* Admitted pro hac vice

Electronically Signed by

Lucas T. Vebber

**WISCONSIN INSTITUTE**

**FOR LAW & LIBERTY, INC.**

RICHARD M. ESENBERG, SBN 1005622

LUCAS T. VEBBER, SBN 1067543

330 East Kilbourn Avenue, Suite 725

Milwaukee, WI 53202

414.727.9455

Lucas@will-law.org

*Counsel for Billie Johnson,*

*Eric O'Keefe, Ed Perkins,*

*and Ronald Zahn*

Electronically Signed by

Misha Tseytlin

**TROUTMAN PEPPER HAMILTON**

**SANDERS LLP**

MISHA TSEYTLIN, SBN 1102199

KEVIN M. LEROY, SBN 1105053

227 W. Monroe, Suite 3900

Chicago, Illinois 60606

608.999.1240

misha.tseytlin@troutman.com

*Counsel for Congressmen Glenn*

*Grothman, Mike Gallagher,*

*Bryan Steil, Tom Tiffany, and*

*Scott Fitzgerald*