

No. 2021AP1450-OA

---

IN THE SUPREME COURT OF WISCONSIN

---

BILLIE JOHNSON, ERIC O'KEEFE, ED PERKINS, AND RONALD  
ZAHN,  
*Petitioners,*

BLACK LEADERS ORGANIZING FOR COMMUNITIES, VOCES DE LA FRONTERA,  
LEAGUE OF WOMEN VOTERS OF WISCONSIN, CINDY FALLONA, LAUREN  
STEPHENSON, REBECCA ALWIN, CONGRESSMAN GLENN GROTHMAN,  
CONGRESSMAN MIKE GALLAGHER, CONGRESSMAN BRYAN STEIL,  
CONGRESSMAN TOM TIFFANY, CONGRESSMAN SCOTT FITZGERALD, LISA  
HUNTER, JACOB ZABEL, JENNIFER OH, JOHN PERSA, GERALDINE SCHERTZ,  
KATHLEEN QUALHEIM, GARY KRENZ, SARAH J. HAMILTON, STEPHEN  
JOSEPH WRIGHT, JEAN-LUC THIFFEAULT, AND SOMESH JHA,  
*Intervenors-Petitioners,*

v.

WISCONSIN ELECTIONS COMMISSION, MARGE BOSTELMANN, in her official  
capacity as a member of the Wisconsin Elections Commission, JULIE  
GLANCEY, in her official capacity as a member of the Wisconsin Elections  
Commission, ANN JACOBS, in her official capacity as a member of the  
Wisconsin Elections Commission, DEAN KNUDSON, in his official capacity as  
a member of the Wisconsin Elections Commission,  
ROBERT SPINDELL, JR., in his official capacity as a member of the Wisconsin  
Elections Commission, AND MARK THOMSEN, in his official capacity as a  
member of the Wisconsin Elections Commission,  
*Respondents,*

THE WISCONSIN LEGISLATURE, GOVERNOR TONY EVERS, in his  
official capacity, AND JANET BEWLEY SENATE DEMOCRATIC MINORITY  
LEADER, on behalf of the Senate Democratic Caucus,  
*Intervenors-Respondents.*

---

PROPOSED JOINT DISCOVERY PLAN

---

Pursuant to the Court's Order of November 17, 2021, the Parties submit the following Joint Discovery Plan:

**1. Scope and Subjects of Discovery; Completion.**

**a. Scope.**

- i. Discovery shall be limited to material that is relevant to whether (and to what degree) the Parties' proposed state legislative and congressional apportionment remedial plans comply with the requirements of state and federal law and other parameters set forth in the Court's decision of November 30, 2021.

**b. Fact Discovery.**

- i. The parties agree that in light of stipulations and the Court's November 30 Order, at this time they do not anticipate that fact discovery is needed beyond the exchange of maps, expert disclosures, and any documents or data that a party intends to rely upon or an expert has relied upon. Noted below, government GIS and Census redistricting data are publicly available on websites maintained by the United States Census Bureau and the Wisconsin Legislative Technology Services Bureau. As indicated below, the Parties stipulate to the authenticity and admissibility of such records.

- ii. If any party seeks to take discovery, it shall do so between December 15 and 23, or otherwise by agreement of the parties or leave of court.<sup>1</sup>
- c. **Expert Discovery.** The Parties agree that, to the extent the federal and Wisconsin rules are different, expert disclosures, reports, and discovery of communications shall be consistent with Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 26(a)(2)(B), (a)(2)(E), (b)(4), (e), as opposed to the Wisconsin rules which would otherwise be applicable.
- d. **Time to Complete Discovery.** Except as stipulated herein and as may be otherwise stipulated, discovery shall be completed by December 23, 2021.

## 2. Initial Disclosures.

- a. The Parties agree that by December 8, the Parties shall disclose all individuals other than experts whose testimony the party intends to use at any possible evidentiary hearing contemplated in the Court's November 17, 2021 Order. This disclosure obligation is ongoing.

## 3. Expert Disclosures

- a. Timing.
  - i. Initial expert disclosures shall be made on December 15, 2021.
  - ii. All Parties agree that any Party may submit an expert report as an attachment to the Responsive

---

<sup>1</sup> The Parties do not waive their rights to object to any discovery sought by any other party.

Briefs due December 30. The scope of any expert report or affidavit submitted with the Responsive Brief must be limited to rebutting initial briefs, maps, and reports.

- iii. All Parties agree that any Party may submit an expert report as an attachment to the Reply Briefs due January 4. The scope of any expert report or affidavit submitted with the Reply Brief must be limited to rebutting responsive briefs and reports.
- iv. The Parties may disclose additional experts in connection with the Parties' Responsive and Reply briefs.

b. Reports.

- i. Expert reports or affidavits shall contain all components specified in Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(a)(2)(B), including compensation and work history, as well as identification of facts, data, and assumptions relied upon, and a list of materials relied upon.
- ii. The Parties recognize that the Court previously ordered that expert reports or affidavits shall "strive for brevity and shall contain an executive summary not to exceed 1,100 words."
- iii. Parties and experts have a duty to supplement per Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(a)(2)(E) and (e).

c. Documents and Supporting Materials.

- i. No later than the day following the disclosure of any expert report or affidavit, sponsoring Parties

must make available facts or data considered by the expert witness in forming his or her opinion otherwise not disclosed and available in the expert reports. Without limitation, this disclosure shall include any raw data (that is not otherwise clearly identified and publicly available), any modified data, r-files, statistical analysis, formulas, other backup sufficient to replicate analysis, inaccessible articles or books, and similar materials relied upon. The Parties agree to make good faith efforts to make such information available the same day as the disclosure of the expert report or affidavit.

d. Depositions.

- i. The parties agree there will be no expert depositions.

4. **Production of Maps.**

- a. Proposed maps shall be disclosed in the following formats: CSV, Shapefile, and PDF.
- b. Each CSV file must contain two fields: one that identifies all census blocks in the state, and another that identifies the district to which each census block has been assigned. File compression software shall not be used.
- c. Parties shall exchange proposed maps with the expert disclosures on December 15, 2021.

## **5. Production of Other Documents; Stipulations.**

- a. Petitioners, the Legislature, the BLOC and Hunter Intervenor-Petitioners, the Congressmen, the Governor, the Citizen Mathematicians and Scientists, the Wisconsin Elections Commission Respondents, and Senator Bewley stipulate to the authenticity and admissibility of the 2020 Census Redistricting Data available at <https://legis.wisconsin.gov/ltsb/gis/data/> and listed under the subheadings “U.S. DOJ Summarized Fields” and “2020 TIGER Geography & P.L. 94-171 Redistricting Data as U.S. DOJ Summarized Fields.”
- b. Petitioners, the Legislature, the BLOC and Hunter Intervenor-Petitioners, the Congressmen, the Governor, the Citizen Mathematicians and Scientists, the Wisconsin Elections Commission Respondents, and Senator Bewley stipulate to the authenticity and admissibility of the relevant portions of the legislative record (including Legislative Reference Bureau and Legislative Council materials) contained on the Legislature’s website for the following bills and resolutions:
  - i. 2021 Wisconsin Senate Bill 621 (available at <https://docs.legis.wisconsin.gov/2021/proposals/reg/sen/bill/sb621> and referenced legislative journal entries).
  - ii. 2021 Wisconsin Senate Bill 622 (available at <https://docs.legis.wisconsin.gov/2021/proposals/reg/>

- sen/bill/sb622 and referenced legislative journal entries).
- iii. 2021 Wisconsin Assembly Bill 624 (available at <https://docs.legis.wisconsin.gov/2021/proposals/ab624> and referenced legislative journal entries).
  - iv. 2021 Wisconsin Assembly Bill 625 (available at <https://docs.legis.wisconsin.gov/2021/proposals/reg/asm/bill/ab625> and referenced legislative journal entries).
  - v. 2021 Senate Joint Resolution 65 (available at [https://docs.legis.wisconsin.gov/2021/proposals/reg/sen/joint\\_resolution/sjr65](https://docs.legis.wisconsin.gov/2021/proposals/reg/sen/joint_resolution/sjr65) and reference legislative journal entries).
- c. The Legislature created a website relating to redistricting that, among other things, allowed the public to submit proposed maps between September 1, 2021 through October 15, 2021. This website used the domains <https://drawyourdistrict.legis.wisconsin.gov> and <https://redistricting.legis.wisconsin.gov>. Petitioners, the Legislature, the Congressmen, the Citizen Mathematicians and Scientists stipulate to the authenticity and admissibility of all materials contained at the domains <https://drawyourdistrict.legis.wisconsin.gov> and <https://redistricting.legis.wisconsin.gov> as of the date of this submission.

- d. Petitioners, the Legislature, the BLOC and Hunter Intervenor-Petitioners, the Governor, the Congressmen, the Citizen Mathematicians and Scientists, the Wisconsin Elections Commission Respondents, and Senator Bewley stipulate to the authenticity and admissibility of Executive Order #66, which can be accessed through the Legislature's website at [https://docs.legis.wisconsin.gov/code/executive\\_orders/2019\\_tony\\_evers/2020-66.pdf](https://docs.legis.wisconsin.gov/code/executive_orders/2019_tony_evers/2020-66.pdf).
- e. The Citizen Mathematicians and Scientists stipulate to the authenticity and admissibility of the General Election Returns from the Election Data section of the above website (<https://legis.wisconsin.gov/ltsb/gis/data/>).
- f. The Citizen Mathematicians and Scientists stipulate to the authenticity and admissibility of the CVAP (Special Tabulation by Race and Ethnicity) data for the five-year period ending in 2019, available at <https://www.census.gov/programs-surveys/decennial-census/about/voting-rights/cvap.2019.html>.
- g. The Citizen Mathematicians and Scientists stipulate to the authenticity and admissibility of the Shapefiles of American Indian Lands from the Census PL Data, titled AMIN shapefile: tl\_2020\_55\_aiannh20.zip", which is available at [https://www2.census.gov/geo/tiger/TIGER2020PL/STATE/55\\_WISCONSIN/55/](https://www2.census.gov/geo/tiger/TIGER2020PL/STATE/55_WISCONSIN/55/), as well as the blockfiles of the same information, which is titled



“BlockAssign\_ST55\_WI\_AIANNH.txt,” available at <https://www.census.gov/geographies/reference-files/time-series/geo/block-assignment-files.html>

- h. The Governor, the Wisconsin Elections Commission Respondents, and the Citizen Mathematicians and Scientists stipulate to the authenticity and admissibility of the Primary Election Returns from the Wisconsin Elections Commission, available at <https://elections.wi.gov/elections-voting/results-all>.
- i. The Parties agree to work cooperatively to join all parties where possible to the above-stipulations and to enter additional stipulations. Parties agree to enter such stipulations by January 11, 2022, and shall file those completed and additional stipulations with the Court by January 12, 2022.
- j. If the Parties contemplate substantial production of documents, other than those stipulated to above, then all production shall be in a format mutually agreed upon in a separate Electronically Stored Information (ESI) discovery protocol.

## **6. Service of Documents**

- a. The Parties stipulate service and production of discovery by electronic mail.
- b. The Parties stipulate that publicly available government records, including for example the legislative record, need not be re-produced during the discovery phase.

## **7. Claims of Privilege and Work Product.**

- a. The Parties agree that any documents in any format that contain privileged information or legal work product (and all copies) shall be immediately returned to the producing party if the documents appear on their face to have been inadvertently produced or if there is notice of the inadvertent production within 10 days after the producing party discovers that the inadvertent production occurred. The Parties agree that the recipient of such inadvertently produced information will not use the information, in any way, in the prosecution of the recipient's case. Further, the Parties agree that the recipient may not assert that the producing Party waived privilege or work product protection based upon the inadvertent production; however, the recipient may challenge the assertion of the privilege and seek a Court order denying such privilege.

## **8. Post-Briefing Procedures.** Should the Court decide an evidentiary hearing “on one or more of four consecutive days beginning January 18, 2022” is necessary, the Parties may negotiate additional pretrial disclosure deadlines (*e.g.*, exhibit lists, witness lists, and the like) at a later date. The Parties offer the following comments on potential proceedings:

- a. Should the Court decide an evidentiary hearing “on one or more of four consecutive days beginning January 18, 2022” is necessary, The Legislature proposes that

Parties shall exchange written direct testimony of all fact and expert witnesses no later than January 11, 2022. The expert written direct testimony may be the experts' report(s), but is not required to be the experts' reports given the potential for written direct testimony to streamline the issues. Direct testimony would be filed with the Court no later than January 12, 2022. Absent stipulation by all Parties, witnesses for whom a sponsoring party has submitted direct testimony shall be made available for live cross-examination and re-direct.

- b. Should the Court decide an evidentiary hearing "on one or more of four consecutive days beginning January 18, 2022" is necessary, the Citizen Mathematicians and Scientists take no position on whether expert direct testimony should occur live at the hearing or be in the form of written direct testimony. If the Court prefers written direct testimony, however, the Citizen Mathematicians and Scientists submit that, for the sake of judicial economy, each Party's expert reports or affidavits serve as its written expert direct testimony and no additional written direct testimony be permitted. Absent stipulation by all Parties, witnesses for whom a sponsoring party has submitted direct testimony shall be made available for live cross-examination, re-direct, and re-cross.

- c. The Petitioners and the Congressmen state that any evidentiary hearing appears to be unnecessary, since the parties have agreed that no fact discovery is needed beyond exchange of maps, expert disclosures, and disclosure of data relied upon by experts.
- d. The BLOC and Hunter Intervenor-Petitioners, the Governor, and Senator Bewley agree with the Petitioners and the Congressmen that any evidentiary hearing appears to be unnecessary, since the parties have agreed that no fact discovery is needed beyond exchange of maps, expert disclosures, and disclosure of data relied upon by experts. Should the Court decide an evidentiary hearing “on one or more of four consecutive days beginning January 18, 2022” is necessary,” the BLOC and Hunter Intervenor-Petitioners, the Governor, and Senator Bewley propose the expert reports and affidavits submitted to the Court shall serve as the direct testimony for all witnesses, whether expert or otherwise, in this proceeding. Cross-examination of expert witnesses may be unnecessary, but the parties can make expert witnesses available if the court would like oral expert testimony.
- e. The Wisconsin Elections Commission Respondents take no position on post-briefing procedures.

Dated December 3, 2021.

Respectfully Submitted,

*Electronically Signed By Anthony LoCoco*

RICHARD M. ESENBERG (WI Bar No. 1005622)

ANTHONY LOCOCO (WI Bar No. 1101773)

LUCAS VEBBER (WI Bar No. 1067543)

Wisconsin Institute for Law & Liberty, Inc.

330 East Kilbourn Avenue, Suite 725

Milwaukee, Wisconsin 53202-3141

Phone: (414) 727-9455

Facsimile: (414) 727-6385

Rick@will-law.org

ALoCoco@will-law.org

Lucas@will-law.org

*Attorneys for Petitioners*

*Electronically Signed By Doug M. Poland*

Douglas M. Poland, SBN 1055189

Jeffrey A. Mandell, SBN 1100406

Colin T. Roth, SBN 1103985

Rachel E. Snyder, SBN 1090427

Richard A. Manthe, SBN 1099199

Carly Gerads, SBN 1106808

STAFFORD ROSENBAUM LLP

222 West Washington Avenue, Suite 900

P.O. Box 1784

Madison, WI 53701-1784

dpoland@staffordlaw.com

jmandell@staffordlaw.com

croth@staffordlaw.com

rsnyder@staffordlaw.com

rmanthe@staffordlaw.com

cgerads@staffordlaw.com

608.256.0226

Mel Barnes, SBN 1096012

LAW FORWARD, INC.

P.O. Box 326

Madison, WI 53703-0326

mbarnes@lawforward.org  
608.535.9808

Mark P. Gaber\*  
Christopher Lamar\*  
CAMPAIGN LEGAL CENTER  
1101 14th St. NW Suite 400  
Washington, DC 20005  
mgaber@campaignlegal.org  
clamar@campaignlegal.org  
202.736.2200

Annabelle Harless\*  
CAMPAIGN LEGAL CENTER  
55 W. Monroe St., Ste. 1925  
Chicago, IL 60603  
aharless@campaignlegal.org  
312.312.2885  
\*Admitted pro hac vice

*Attorneys for Intervenor-Petitioners, Black Leaders Organizing for Communities, Voces de la Frontera, the League of Women Voters of Wisconsin, Cindy Fallona, Lauren Stephenson, and Rebecca Alwin*

*Electronically Signed By Misha Tseytlin*  
MISHA TSEYTLIN  
State Bar No. 1102199  
KEVIN M. LEROY  
State Bar No. 1105053  
TROUTMAN PEPPER HAMILTON SANDERS LLP  
227 W. Monroe, Suite 3900  
Chicago, Illinois 60606  
(608) 999-1240 (MT)  
(312) 759-1939 (fax)  
misha.tseytlin@troutman.com

*Counsel for Congressmen Glenn Grothman, Mike Gallagher, Bryan Steil, Tom Tiffany, and Scott Fitzgerald*

*Electronically Signed By Charles G. Curtis*

Charles G. Curtis, Jr.

Bar No. 1013075

PERKINS COIE LLP

33 East Main Street, Suite 201

Madison, WI 53703-3095

Telephone: (608) 663-5411

Facsimile: (608) 283-4462

CCurtis@perkinscoie.com

Jacob D. Shelly\*

Christina A. Ford\*

William K. Hancock\*

ELIAS LAW GROUP LLP

10 G St., NE, Suite 600

Washington, D.C. 2002

JShelly@elias.law

CFord@elias.law

WHancock@elias.law

\*Admitted *Pro Hac Vice*

Attorneys for *Hunter* Intervenor-Petitioners

Michael P. May SBN: 1011610

Sarah A. Zylstra SBN: 1033159

Tanner G. Jean-Louis SBN: 1122401

BOARDMAN & CLARK LLP

1 S. Pinckney Street, Suite 410

P.O. Box 927

Madison, WI 53701

Phone: (608) 257-9521

mmay@boardmanclark.com

szlystra@boardmanclark.com

tjeanlouis@boardmanclark.com

David J. Bradford \*PHV

JENNER & BLOCK LLP

353 N. Clark Street

Chicago, IL 60654

Phone: (312) 923-2975

dbradford@jenner.com

Jessica Ring Amunson \*PHV  
Sam Hirsch \*PHV  
Rebecca Fate \*PHV  
JENNER & BLOCK LLP  
1099 New York Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20001  
Phone: (202) 639-6000  
jamunson@jenner.com  
shirsch@jenner.com  
rfate@jenner.com

*Electronically Signed By Elizabeth Edmondson*

Elizabeth Edmondson \*PHV  
Olivia Hoffman \*PHV  
JENNER & BLOCK LLP  
919 Third Avenue  
New York, NY 10022  
Phone: (212) 891-1600  
eedmondson@jenner.com  
ohoffman@jenner.com

*Attorneys for Intervenors-Petitioners Citizen Mathematicians and Scientists*

*Electronically Signed By Karla Z. Keckhaver*

KARLA Z. KECKHAVER  
Assistant Attorney General  
State Bar #1028242  
STEVEN C. KILPATRICK  
Assistant Attorney General  
State Bar #1025452  
THOMAS C. BELLAVIA  
Assistant Attorney General  
State Bar #1030182

Wisconsin Department of Justice  
Post Office Box 7857  
Madison, Wisconsin 53707-7857  
(608) 264-6365 (KZK)  
(608) 266-1792 (SCK)



(608) 266-8690 (TCB)  
(608) 294-2907 (Fax)  
keckhaverkz@doj.state.wi.us  
kilpatricksc@doj.state.wi.us  
bellaviatc@doj.state.wi.us

*Attorneys for WEC Respondents*

*Electronically Signed by Kevin M. St. John*

BELL GIFTOS ST. JOHN LLC  
Kevin M. St. John, SBN 1054815  
5325 Wall Street, Ste. 2200  
Madison, Wisconsin 53718  
608.216.7990  
*kstjohn@bellgiftos.com*

LAWFAIR LLC  
Adam K. Mortara, SBN 1038391  
125 South Wacker, Ste. 300  
Chicago, Illinois 60606  
773.750.7154  
*mortara@lawfairllc.com*

CONSOVOY MCCARTHY PLLC  
Jeffrey M. Harris\*  
Taylor A.R. Meehan\*\*  
James P. McGlone\*\*\*  
1600 Wilson Boulevard, Ste. 700  
Arlington, Virginia 22209  
703.243.9423  
*jeff@consovoymccarthy.com*  
*taylor@consovoymccarthy.com*  
*jim@consovoymccarthy.com*

*\* Admitted pro hac vice*

*\*\* Admitted pro hac vice; licensed to practice in Ill. & D.C.*

*\*\*\* Admitted pro hac vice; licensed to practice in Mass.*

*Attorneys for Intervenor-Respondent, The Wisconsin Legislature*

JOSHUA L. KAUL  
Attorney General of Wisconsin

*Electronically Signed By Anthony D. Russomanno*

ANTHONY D. RUSSOMANNO  
Assistant Attorney General  
State Bar #1076050

BRIAN P. KEENAN  
Assistant Attorney General  
State Bar #1056525

Wisconsin Department of Justice  
Post Office Box 7857  
Madison, Wisconsin 53707-7857  
(608) 267-2238 (ADR)  
(608) 266-0020 (BPK)  
(608) 294-2907 (Fax)  
russomannoad@doj.state.wi.us  
keenanbp@doj.state.wi.us

*Attorneys for Governor Tony Evers*

PINES BACH LLP

*Electronically signed by Tamara B. Packard*

Tamara B. Packard, SBN 1023111  
Aaron G. Dumas, SBN 1087951

Mailing Address:

122 West Washington Ave., Suite 900  
Madison, WI 53703  
(608) 251-0101 (telephone)  
(608) 251-2883 (facsimile)  
tpackard@pinesbach.com  
adumas@pinesbach.com

*Attorneys for Intervenor-Respondent  
Janet Bewley, State Senate Democratic Minority  
Leader on behalf of the Senate Democratic Caucus*