

**FILED**

**NOV 16 2023**

**CLERK OF SUPREME COURT  
OF WISCONSIN**

**IN THE SUPREME COURT OF WISCONSIN**

No. 2023AP1399

REBECCA CLARKE, RUBEN ANTHONY, TERRY DAWSON, DANA GLASSTEIN, ANN GROVES-LLOYD, CARL HUJET, JERRY IVERSON, TIA JOHNSON, ANGIE KIRST, SELIKA LAWTON, FABIAN MALDONADO, ANNEMARIE MCCLELLAN, JAMES MCNETT, BRITTANY MURIELLO, ELA JOOSTEN (PARI) SCHILS, NATHANIEL SLACK, MARY SMITH-JOHNSON, DENISE SWEET AND GABRIELLE YOUNG,

*Petitioners,*

GOVERNOR TONY EVERS IN HIS OFFICIAL CAPACITY, NATHAN ATKINSON, STEPHEN JOSEPH WRIGHT, GARY KRENZ, SARAH J. HAMILTON, JEAN-LUC THIFFEAULT, SOMESH JHA, JOANNE KANE AND LEAH DUDLEY,

*Intervenors-Petitioners,*

v.

WISCONSIN ELECTIONS COMMISSION, DON MILLIS, ROBERT F. SPINDELL, JR., MARK L. THOMSEN, ANN S. JACOBS, MARGE BOSTELMANN, CARRIE RIEPL, IN THEIR OFFICIAL CAPACITIES AS MEMBERS OF THE WISCONSIN ELECTIONS COMMISSION; MEAGAN WOLFE IN HER OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS THE ADMINISTRATOR OF THE WISCONSIN ELECTIONS COMMISSION; ANDRE JACQUE, TIM CARPENTER, ROB HUTTON, CHRIS LARSON, DEVIN LEMAHIEU, STEPHEN L. NASS, JOHN JAGLER, MARK SPREITZER, HOWARD MARKLEIN, RACHAEL CABRAL-GUEVARA, VAN H. WANGGAARD, JESSE L. JAMES, ROMAINE ROBERT QUINN, DIANNE H. HESSELBEIN, CORY TOMCZYK, JEFF SMITH AND CHRIS KAPENGA IN THEIR OFFICIAL CAPACITIES AS MEMBERS OF THE WISCONSIN SENATE,

*Respondents,*

WISCONSIN LEGISLATURE, BILLIE JOHNSON, CHRIS GOEBEL, ED PERKINS, ERIC O'KEEFE, JOE SANFELIPPO, TERRY MOULTON, ROBERT JENSEN, RON ZAHN, RUTH ELMER AND RUTH STRECK,

*Intervenors-Respondents.*

---

**JOINT RESPONSE OF PETITIONERS, GOVERNOR TONY EVERS,  
SENATORS CARPENTER *ET AL.*, AND ATKINSON INTERVENORS TO  
THE COURT'S NOVEMBER 13, 2023 ORDER**

---

*Counsel listed on the following pages*

Mark P. Gaber\*  
Brent Ferguson\*  
Hayden Johnson\*  
Benjamin Phillips\*  
Michael Ortega\*  
CAMPAIGN LEGAL  
CENTER  
1101 14th St. NW, Ste. 400  
Washington, DC 20005  
202.736.2200

Annabelle E. Harless\*  
CAMPAIGN LEGAL  
CENTER  
55 W. Monroe St., Ste. 1925  
Chicago, Illinois 60603  
202.732.2200

Ruth M. Greenwood\*  
Nicholas O. Stephanopoulos\*  
ELECTION LAW CLINIC  
AT HARVARD LAW  
SCHOOL  
4105 Wasserstein Hall  
6 Everett Street  
Cambridge, Massachusetts 02138  
617.998.1010

Daniel S. Lenz, SBN 1082058  
T.R. Edwards, SBN 1119447  
Elizabeth M. Pierson, SBN 1115866  
Scott B. Thompson, SBN 1098161  
LAW FORWARD, INC.  
222 W. Washington Ave.  
Suite 250  
Madison, Wisconsin 53703  
608.556.9120

Douglas M. Poland, SBN 1055189  
Jeffrey A. Mandell, SBN 1100406  
Rachel E. Snyder, SBN 1090427  
STAFFORD ROSENBAUM  
LLP  
222 W. Washington Ave.  
Suite 900  
P.O. Box 1784  
Madison, Wisconsin 53701  
608.256.0226

Elisabeth S. Theodore\*  
John A. Freedman\*  
ARNOLD & PORTER KAYE  
SCHOLER LLP  
601 Massachusetts Ave. NW  
Washington, DC 20001  
202.942.5000

*Attorneys for Petitioners*

Anthony D. Russomanno,  
 SBN 1076050  
 Faye B. Hipsman, SBN 1123933  
 Brian P. Keenan, SBN 1056525  
 Assistant Attorney General  
 WISCONSIN DEPARTMENT  
 OF JUSTICE  
 Post Office Box 7857  
 Madison, Wisconsin 53707-7857  
 608.267.2238 (ADR)  
 608.264.9487 (FBH)  
 608.266.0020 (BPK)  
 608.294.2907 (Fax)

Mel Barnes, SBN 1096012  
 OFFICE OF GOVERNOR  
 TONY EVERS  
 Post Office Box 7863  
 Madison, Wisconsin 53707-7863  
 608.266.1212

Christine P. Sun\*  
 Dax L. Goldstein\*  
 STATES UNITED DEMOCRACY  
 CENTER  
 506 S Spring St.  
 Los Angeles, California 90013  
 202.999.9305

John Hill\*  
 STATES UNITED DEMOCRACY  
 CENTER  
 250 Commons Dr.  
 DuBois, Pennsylvania 15801  
 202.999.9305

*Attorneys for Governor Tony Evers*

Tamara B. Packard, SBN 1023111  
 Eduardo E. Castro, SBN 1117805  
 PINES BACH LLP  
 122 West Washington Avenue  
 Suite 900  
 Madison, Wisconsin 53703  
 608.251.0101

*Attorneys for the Democratic Senator  
 Respondents*

Sarah A. Zylstra, SBN 1033159  
 Tanner G. Jean-Louis, SBN 1122401  
 BOARDMAN CLARK LLP  
 1 South Pinckney Street, Suite 410  
 Madison, Wisconsin 53701  
 608.257.9521

Sam Hirsch\*  
 Jessica Ring Amunson\*  
 Elizabeth B. Deutsch\*  
 Arjun R. Ramamurti\*  
 JENNER & BLOCK LLP  
 1099 New York Avenue NW, Ste 900  
 Washington, DC 20001  
 202.639.6000

*Counsel for Atkinson  
 Intervenors-Petitioners*

*\*Admitted pro hac vice*

Petitioners Rebecca Clarke *et al.*, Intervenor-Petitioner Governor Tony Evers, Respondents Senators Tim Carpenter *et al.*, and Intervenors-Petitioners Nathan Atkinson *et al.* (collectively, “Group One”), by their undersigned counsel, respond as follows to the Court’s November 13, 2023 Order regarding oral argument. While each party will be prepared to address questions the Court may pose, pursuant to the Order, Group One will divide the argument as follows:

1. Attorney Mark Gaber,<sup>1</sup> counsel for Petitioners, will address whether the existing state legislative maps violate the express contiguity requirements of Article IV, Sections 4 and 5 of the Wisconsin Constitution and how remedying that violation makes application of the Legislature and *Johnson* Intervenors’ least-change suggestions unworkable. Attorney Gaber will argue for 29 minutes.

2. Assistant Attorney General Anthony D. Russomanno, counsel for Intervenor-Petitioner Governor Tony Evers, will address whether the adoption of the existing state legislative maps violates the Wisconsin Constitution’s separation of powers between the Executive and Judicial Branches. Assistant Attorney General Russomanno will argue for 12 minutes.

3. Attorney Tamara B. Packard, counsel for the Democratic Senator Respondents, will address whether the adoption of the existing state legislative maps violates the Wisconsin Constitution’s separation of powers between the Legislative

---

<sup>1</sup> This Court admitted Attorney Gaber *pro hac vice* on August 8, 2023. Pursuant to Wis. Stat. § (Rule) 809.85(2)(b), attorneys for Petitioners admitted to practice in the State of Wisconsin shall be present in person and will introduce Attorney Gaber.

and Judicial Branches. She will also address the role of the Judicial Branch in crafting a remedy for the constitutional violations. Attorney Packard will argue for 12 minutes.

4. Attorney Sam Hirsch,<sup>2</sup> counsel for Intervenor-Petitioners Nathan Atkinson *et al.*, will address the standards and process that the Court should use in imposing a remedy for the constitutional violations. Attorney Hirsch will also answer questions regarding the pending joint motion requesting a corrected redistricting dataset from LTSB. Attorney Hirsch will argue for 12 minutes.

5. Group One reserves the remaining 15 minutes of its allotted time for rebuttal. Group One will divide that time as follows: Attorney Hirsch will argue for 5 minutes, then Assistant Attorney General Russomanno will argue for 3 minutes, then Attorney Packard will argue for 2 minutes, then Attorney Gaber will argue for the remaining 5 minutes.

6. Each of the four attorneys also may address any matters unique to their parties' positions.

7. Group One respectfully requests that the Court apply these agreed-upon time limits to each party, and not reduce a party's allotted argument time because any other party exceeded theirs.

---

<sup>2</sup> This Court admitted Attorney Hirsch *pro hac vice* on October 20, 2023. Pursuant to Wis. Stat. § (Rule) 809.85(2)(b), attorneys for Atkinson Intervenor admitted to practice in the State of Wisconsin shall be present in person and will introduce Attorney Hirsch.

Respectfully submitted this 16th day of November, 2023.

By Electronically signed by Daniel S. Lenz

Daniel S. Lenz, SBN 1082058

T.R. Edwards, SBN 1119447

Elizabeth M. Pierson, SBN 1115866

Scott B. Thompson, SBN 1098161

LAW FORWARD, INC.

222 W. Washington Ave., Suite 250

Madison, Wisconsin 53703

608.556.9120

dlenz@lawforward.org

tedwards@lawforward.org

epierson@lawforward.org

sthompson@lawforward.org

Douglas M. Poland, SBN 1055189

Jeffrey A. Mandell, SBN 1100406

Rachel E. Snyder, SBN 1090427

STAFFORD ROSENBAUM LLP

222 West Washington Avenue, Suite 900

P.O. Box 1784

Madison, Wisconsin 53701-1784

608.256.0226

dpoland@staffordlaw.com

jmandell@staffordlaw.com

rsnyder@staffordlaw.com

Mark P. Gaber\*

Brent Ferguson\*

Hayden Johnson\*

Benjamin Phillips\*

Michael Ortega\*

CAMPAIGN LEGAL CENTER

1101 14th St. NW Suite 400

Washington, DC 20005

202.736.2200

mgaber@campaignlegal.org

bferguson@campaignlegal.org

hjohnson@campaignlegal.org

bphillips@campaignlegal.org

mortega@campaignlegal.org

Annabelle E. Harless\*  
CAMPAIGN LEGAL CENTER  
55 W. Monroe St., Ste. 1925  
Chicago, Illinois 60603  
202.736.2200  
aharless@campaignlegal.org

Ruth M. Greenwood\*  
Nicholas O. Stephanopoulos\*  
ELECTION LAW CLINIC AT  
HARVARD LAW SCHOOL  
4105 Wasserstein Hall  
6 Everett Street  
Cambridge, Massachusetts 02138  
617.998.1010  
rgreenwood@law.harvard.edu  
nstephanopoulos@law.harvard.edu

Elisabeth S. Theodore\*  
John A. Freedman\*  
ARNOLD & PORTER KAYE  
SCHOLER LLP  
601 Massachusetts Ave. NW  
Washington, DC 20001  
202.942.5000  
elisabeth.theodore@arnoldporter.com  
john.freedman@arnoldporter.com

*Attorneys for Petitioners*

By Electronically signed by Anthony D. Russomanno  
Anthony D. Russomanno, SBN 1076050  
Faye B. Hipsman, SBN 1123933  
Brian P. Keenan, SBN 1056525  
Assistant Attorney General  
WISCONSIN DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE  
Post Office Box 7857  
Madison, Wisconsin 53707-7857  
608.267.2238 (ADR)  
608.264.9487 (FBH)  
608.266.0020 (BPK)  
608.294.2907 (Fax)

russomannoad@doj.state.wi.us  
hipsmanfb@doj.state.wi.us  
keenanbp@doj.state.wi.us

Mel Barnes, SBN 1096012  
OFFICE OF GOVERNOR TONY EVERS  
Post Office Box 7863  
Madison, Wisconsin 53707-7863  
608.266.1212  
mel.barnes@wisconsin.gov

Christine P. Sun\*  
Dax L. Goldstein\*  
STATES UNITED DEMOCRACY CENTER  
506 S Spring St.  
Los Angeles, California 90013  
202.999.9305  
christine@statesuniteddemocracy.org  
dax@statesuniteddemocracy.org

John Hill\*  
STATES UNITED DEMOCRACY CENTER  
250 Commons Dr.  
DuBois, Pennsylvania 15801  
202.999.9305  
john@statesuniteddemocracy.org

*Attorneys for Governor Tony Evers*

By Electronically signed by Tamara B. Packard  
Tamara B. Packard, SBN 1023111  
Eduardo E. Castro, SBN 1117805  
PINES BACH LLP  
122 West Washington Avenue  
Suite 900  
Madison, Wisconsin 53703  
608.251.0101  
tpackard@pinesbach.com  
ecastro@pinesbach.com

*Attorneys for the Democratic Senator Respondents*



By: Electronically signed by Sarah A. Zylstra

Sarah A. Zylstra, SBN 1033159

Tanner G. Jean-Louis, SBN 1122401

BOARDMAN CLARK LLP

1 South Pinckney Street, Suite 410

Madison, Wisconsin 53701

608.257.9521

szylstra@boardmanclark.com

tjeanlouis@boardmanclark.com

Sam Hirsch\*

Jessica Ring Amunson\*

Elizabeth B. Deutsch\*

Arjun R. Ramamurti\*

JENNER & BLOCK LLP

1099 New York Avenue NW, Ste 900

Washington, DC 20001

202.639.6000

shirsch@jenner.com

jamunson@jenner.com

edeutsch@jenner.com

aramamurti@jenner.com

*Counsel for Atkinson Intervenors-Petitioners*

*\*Admitted pro hac vice*